

NORTH EAST CLUSTER RESEARCH REPORTNorth East cluster research report

Report on research undertaken by BALTIC, the Laing Art Gallery, Hatton Gallery, Amino and ISIS Arts in collaboration with the International Centre for Cultural and Heritage Studies, University of Newcastle, and partner artists and teachers.

International Centre for Cultural and Heritage Studies, University of Newcastle

Final report by Andrew Newman and Chris Whitehead, International Centre for Cultural and Heritage Studies, University of Newcastle, in collaboration with Judy Thomas (BALTICBaltic), Jean Taylor (Hatton Gallery), John Quinn and Sharon Bailey (ISIS Arts), Becky Davies (Laing Art Gallery), Ben Ponton (Amino), Iain Wheeldon and Nisha Duggal (*enquire* coordinators).

Contents

1	Research question
1	Research context
2	Theoretical frameworks: human, cultural and social capital
7	Introduction
11	Methodology
15	Discussion of findings
34	Conclusions
35	Limitations and further research
36	References

1.0 Research question

The primary research question which this project addresses is:

How do gallery learning activities contribute to participants' development of capital?

This can be further articulated as follows:

- i. i. Are there identifiable shifts in human, cultural and social capital resulting from, or taking place within, contemporary gallery education activities?
- ii. If so, how and why do these shifts take place, and what are their outcomes?
- iii. Does art, and does the gallery context, provide special conditions for shifts in capital, and what are these conditions?

2.0 The context for the research at Newcastle University

The research team is drawn from the International Centre for Cultural and Heritage Studies, which has numerous research-active staff and doctoral students, a strong research culture and an emphasis on interdisciplinary, collaborative research. The core disciplinary areas are museum, gallery and heritage studies. Individual team members bring to this project significant expertise in, and experience of, conducting qualitative research in relation to museum and gallery visiting and participation in museum and gallery education activities. In particular, members of the research team have been involved in:

- i. -
'The Contribution of Museums to an Inclusive Community: an exploratory study' - full title? – funded (ESRC) project examining the contribution of museums to the inclusive community (ref R000223294), the findings of which also inform this project in that they provide insights into the impact of museum visiting on individuals,
- ii. 'Five Arts Cities' research project (funded by Arts Council England and Channel 5) which looks at impact upon older people's lives of participation in gallery education activities,
- iii.iii. DfES-funded Museums and Galleries Education Programme 2 (Stanley et al 2004),
- iv. 'Artist's Insights' research project (funded by Arts Council England and the Museums, Libraries and Archives Council), exploring the impact of writers and visual artists working with young people and educators/facilitators in cultural sites and schools,
- v. General and extensive research into theoretical and historical museology and into art theory.

Of particular relevance for this project are numbers i and ii, both of which use theoretical frameworks derived from studies in cultural capital. The ESRC-funded project on the inclusive community identified problems with cultural policy in relation to the instrumental use of museums and galleries to address problems of social exclusion, and proposed solutions using forms of capital as an analytical framework. (Newman and McLean 2004a and 2004b; Newman, McLean and Urquhart 2005; Newman and McLean 2006) The Five Art Cities project evaluated the responses of over-50s to British Art Show 6 and to associated education activities (artists' talks and artist-led workshops), examining the ways in which cultural capital enabled subjects to respond (be it positively or negatively) to contemporary art (Newman and Whitehead 2006).

3.0 Theoretical frameworks: human, cultural and social capital

3.1. Rationale for the theoretical framework

This research project adopts theoretical frameworks from studies in human, social and cultural capital. While this relates to previous and concurrent work done by the researchers, it has been chosen for this project because it allows for a wide understanding of the ways in which learning processes contribute to the development or consolidation of opportunities available to individuals in broad social and cultural contexts. Using the framework of capital allows us to consider:

- wWhy and how people learn – what cultural and social factors and knowledge potentialise learning?
- wWays in which learners 'personalise' and use learning experiences,
- wWhy individuals are unable or unwilling to learn some things,
- hHow learning is made manifest by individuals,
- wWhat learning experiences might mean in terms of broader structures such as individuals' well-being and careers, social groupings and lifestyle or other choices.

In this sense, capital furnishes a theoretical framework involving highly contextual and nuanced understandings of learning as a phenomenon which may involve one or more of the following with infinitely variable degrees and ratios of importance:

- aAcquisition of knowledge and skills;
- sShifts in behaviour, understanding and affect (DeSimone, Werner and Harris 2002);
- sShifts in self-image, self-awareness and identity;
- sShifts in interpersonal relations and abilities;
- s Shifts in aspirations and leisure choices.

Further benefits of using capital as a theoretical framework are that: i) it allows the research to make use of an established body of theory in a new context and ii) it relates to broader preoccupations in cultural policy about the wider ramifications of individuals' engagement with the arts, e.g. the broad personal, social and (ultimately) civic benefits which have long been seen to be consequent upon such engagement (Mason 2004).

In this way, the proposed research project differs from many studies into museums and learning, which have focused primarily on whether, and to what extent, visitors learn about the topics which curators (and not educators) intended that they would and upon identifiable 'outcomes' (as in ILFA) which suggest finality and do not account for ongoing learning or the active processes involved in it (Hooper-Greenhill 2004). The breadth of this view of learning is also greater than the notion of 'meaning making' which has been used by Hooper-Greenhill et al (2001a and b) to analyse visitors' conscious responses to, and interpretations of, works of art within historical art museum contexts (this research was also purposefully limited in other respects, such as the exclusive use of lone adult subjects from social groups C1 and C2).

While influenced by the definition of informal learning generated by the UNESCO Faure Report (1972) ('the truly lifelong process whereby every individual acquires attitudes, values, skills and knowledge from daily experience and the educative influences and resources in his or her environment ...'), the view of learning suggested here also involves emphasis on learning as a constructive process rather than merely an acquisitional one, acknowledging, through the framework of capital, the importance of prior knowledge, affect and social interaction within it. In this context the study acknowledges Sfard's (1998) resistance to the development of a 'consistent global theory' of learning and her appeal for the use of both 'acquisitional' and 'participatory' metaphors for learning in research: the former suggests that learning involves the acquisition of knowledge as 'data' or 'content', while the latter contextualises learning as constructive participation in communities of practice which have their own dynamic norms and languages.

3.2 Capital

The sociologist Pierre Bourdieu described capital as representing 'the immanent structure of the social world, i.e., the set of constraints, inscribed in the very reality of that world, which govern its functioning in a durable way, determining the chances of success for practices'. In this context it has been broadly used to explore what Bourdieu called 'inequality of opportunity' amongst individuals and the importance for this of *accumulation* (of knowledge, skills, behaviours etc.):

'Capital, which ... takes time to accumulate and which, as a potential capacity to produce profits and to reproduce itself in identical or expanded form, contains a tendency to persist in its being, is a force inscribed in the objectivity of things so that everything is not equally possible or impossible.' (1997: 46)

The concept of capital, in its various forms, has been used in a growing number of publications in sociology and museology to describe the benefits that might be accrued by individuals through developing certain knowledge, attitudes, skills and abilities. In museological literature, Bourdieu's work on 'cultural capital' (1984) has had much currency, in part because of Bourdieu and Darbel's (1966) application of the concept to the understanding of the ways in which visitors behave in museums and galleries and the relationship between social class, education and an individual's ability to engage with high culture (fine art, theatre etc.). This has had a profound influence on museum, gallery and heritage practices, particularly in relation to the emphasis given to considerations of intellectual and attitudinal access in current policies guiding the management, interpretive practices and educational programmes of cultural sites.

However, a further body of literature explores the interdependent nature of forms of capital (e.g. Bourdieu 1997, Coleman 1998; Cote 1996), suggesting that viewing human, social and cultural capital as discrete and autonomous forms may be artificial and potentially misleading. It should also be noted that understandings of the forms of capital with which this research is concerned are varied; for example, Bourdieu's understanding of cultural capital has been critiqued for its overemphasis on social class structures (du Gay et al 1997: 98), while more recent research (e.g. Newman and McLean 2005) has taken a broader view of what, beyond 'high' culture, can constitute cultural capital. This brief introduction to capital will look at each form singly before noting some of the ways in which their interdependencies have been modelled. Finally, it will discuss the relationship between forms of capital and notions of learning within the gallery and outside.

3.3 Human capital

Human capital has been defined as '*the knowledge, skills, competencies and attributes embodied in individuals that facilitate the creation of personal, social and economic well-being*' (Healy et al., 2001: 18). It is often also seen in terms of '*economically salient personal resources*' (Gershuny, 2002: 8) where investments have, or may have, a direct financial 'payoff' in terms of employment.

Côté (2001) states that the term 'human capital' was first used in the early 1960s by economists such as Schultz (1961) who considered the idea of viewing human beings as a form of capital who are invested in and who invest in themselves. He stated that human capital was increasing at a much greater rate than non-human capital and this was responsible for a significant proportion of post-war economic progress.

Becker (1993) used the economic returns of educational attainment as a way of measuring human capital. He showed that the average income of those with higher education was greater than the income of those without. However, Côté (2001) criticised such an approach as it ignores the complex nature of human learning which occurs over a lifetime. Much research has focused on the economic benefits of the acquisition of knowledge and skills but other research has demonstrated its wider social benefits (Behrman and Stacey, 1997). The acquisition of human capital appears to have a beneficial impact upon health, reduces crime and increases civic participation.

3.4 Social capital

Social capital has been the focus of an extensive body of research and literature. For example, Putnam (2000), charting the decline of political and community participation in north American society, presented evidence linking social capital with health and happiness, democracy and safe and productive neighbourhoods. Veenstra (2001) has also undertaken research linking social capital with health. 'Social capital' is based upon the relationships

between people and the concept has called attention to the importance of civic traditions (Côté, 2001).

Three types of social capital have been identified: *bonding*, which refers to links with members of families or ethnic groups; *bridging* which refers to links with distant friends, associates and colleagues; and finally *linking*, which refers to relations between different social strata, or between the powerful and less powerful. It is viewed (Healy, Côté, Helliwell and Held, 2000: 39) as relational, not being the property of a single individual and produced by investments that are not as direct as investment in physical capital. A further source of social capital is seen as civil society and the development of associations and voluntary organisations. The greater the investment in social capital amongst a group the greater the social cohesion of that group will be. Notably, the existence of high levels of social capital can also be seen negatively; in particular the prevalence of bonding has been related to the development and maintenance of insular communities (for example, Putnam (2000) discusses high-social-capital groups such as 'exclusive' golf clubs and the Klu Klux Klan and notes that investments in social capital are not always benign or benevolent).

3.5 Cultural capital

Cultural capital was described by Bourdieu (1997) as existing in three forms: in an embodied state, an objectified state in the form of cultural goods, and in an institutionalised state that confers original properties on 'cultural capital' that it is presumed to guarantee, for example educational qualifications. Gershuny (2002: 8-9) defines it as, '*knowledge related to the participation in, and enjoyment of the various forms of consumption in society*', where '*specific knowledge about consumption contributes to an individual's satisfaction with their consumption*'. As stated, Bourdieu's work on cultural capital has been particularly influential in the field of museology, in part because the consumption of art museum experiences was a focus of Bourdieu's own research in 1960s' France. Bourdieu and Darbel (1966) stated that, '*it is indisputable that our society offers to all the pure possibility of taking advantage of works (of art) on display in museums, it remains the case that only some have the real possibility of doing so.*' They go on to say that the time a visitor takes to view a work of art is directly in proportion to the ability of the viewer to decipher the range of meanings that are available to them. Works of art, when considered as symbolic goods, can only be fully understood by those who have sufficient 'cultural capital' to interpret the coded meanings held within them and this may be correlated with educational attainment.

At the same time, the museum or gallery itself as an environment and an institution represents a 'test' for visitors, who are expected to engage in certain intellectual and behavioural practices which may be second nature or may be highly unfamiliar (e.g. forms of aesthetic appreciation, the comprehension of messages encoded in display and decorousness in body language and physical and verbal actions) (Whitehead 2005). In this context a visitor's cultural capital can make the difference between his or her experience of the museum or gallery as a comfortable environment or as a daunting and confusing one (see Bourdieu and Darbel 1966).

3.6 Interdependencies between human, social and cultural capital

The relationship between cultural capital and human and social capital is complex, but it is widely believed that they are fundamentally contingent upon one another. Bourdieu (1997) saw human capital as being dependent on cultural capital, and that the volume of social capital is dependent on the size of the networks that can be mobilized and on the volume of the other forms of capital held by those with whom the connections are being made. He also emphasised the fundamental importance of family (i.e. social) relations in the transmission of

cultural capital. Willms (2001: 55) pointed out that, '*people become members of social networks by learning the language of the culture, and using it to engage in social relations*'. Coleman (1988), (also quoted in Healy, Côté, Helliwell, and Held, (2001)) states that, '*the role of strong communities and trust among parents, educators and pupils in fostering education and learning can support habits, skills and values conducive to social participation*.' In this sense it is possible to think in terms of capital formations in which human, social and cultural capital are in dynamic interrelationships; as it were, a shifting map of individuals' abilities to access opportunities. The ramifications of the interdependency of these forms of capital for methodology, data collection and analysis will be discussed below.

3.7 Forms of capital and notions of learning within the gallery and outside

The learning outcomes suggested by the use of human, social and cultural capital in the framing of this research include, but are not limited to:

- changes in capital formations,
- increased understanding of art as a body of practices, products, technologies and heuristic/intellectual approaches (e.g. valuing subjectivity, trial and error and calculated risk-taking),
- increased familiarity with, and ability to use, the experiences of making art, viewing art and visiting art galleries,
- increased social interaction through engagement with art (i.e. making, critiquing, showing and displaying) with family members (bonding) peers (bonding and bridging), and others, including gallery staff and artists (linking),
- increased understanding of role of art in social, professional, economic and personal life,
- increased understanding of possible economic or employment benefits of engaging with art,
- increased self-interrogation about career plans in relation to engagement with art and the contemporary art gallery.

Clearly, the other important focus in this context is the extent to which such outcomes were anticipated or intended (consciously or unconsciously) by teachers', education staff and artists involved in the delivery of gallery education projects.

3.8 Definition of terms

Human capital: the knowledge, skills, competencies and attributes embodied in individuals which facilitate the creation of personal, social and economic well-being and; economically salient personal resources where investments have, or may have, a direct financial 'payoff' in terms of employment.

Social capital: Putnam defines social capital as the '*norms of reciprocity and networks of civic engagement*' as well as trust, all of which '*can improve the efficiency of society by facilitating coordinated actions*' (1993: 167). Numerous other definitions exist, most of which focus on networks of relationships (and the development thereof) between persons, groups, communities and institutions, and engagement in collective, collaborative or shared activities to achieve mutual benefits.

Cultural capital: accumulated knowledge of, and familiarity with, (bourgeois or other) cultural practices which enable individuals to behave appropriately (i.e. according to social norms) within given contexts and to decode stimuli (e.g. artworks).

Capital formations: the dynamic interrelationships between human, social and cultural capital within individuals; the nature of the contingency of different forms of capital upon one another in relation to individuals' ability to access opportunities of various kinds (e.g. building skills, accessing networks and bodies of knowledge, learning behaviour etc.).

4.0 Research ethics

Ethics were considered to be of prime importance in the planning and conduct of the project, in particular because it involved human subjects. The following principles were applied:

1. Honesty to research staff and subjects about the purpose, methods and intended and possible uses of the research, and any risks involved.
2. Confidentiality of information supplied by research subjects and anonymity of respondents.
3. Independence and impartiality of researchers to the subject of the research. The project was managed in accordance with Newcastle University's Code of Good Practice in Research¹ (1) and the British Sociological Association Code of Conduct, the Social Research Association Ethical Guidelines and the Market Research Society Code of Conduct.

5.0 Introduction

The organisations that undertook educational activities funded by the enquire programme in the North East were:

- BALTIC Centre for Contemporary Art
- Laing Art Gallery, Tyne and Wear Museums
- ISIS arts
- Hatton Gallery, University of Newcastle
- Amino

Research was undertaken on projects run by the BALTIC, Laing Art Gallery and ISIS arts. The Hatton Gallery and Amino were not involved because their projects did not coincide with the research period. Summary baseline data for the three organisations who took part in the research programme has been included as an appendix. **number ?**. The research for the North East cluster was carried out between December 2004 and March 2006.

The following describes the organisations, activities and schools in detail, taking each of the host organisations in turn.

Laing Art Gallery (6)

The Laing Art Gallery is part of Tyne and Wear Museums which is a federation of 11 museums and galleries on Tyneside and Wearside. Collectively, they attract over one million visitors a year (1,277,739) in 2002/2003). The Laing was founded in 1901 by Alexander

¹ <http://www.ncl.ac.uk/business-directorate/strategy/policies/practice.phtml>

Laing, a Scottish wine and spirit merchant. The building was opened in 1904. The Laing houses an extensive collection of British oil paintings, watercolours, ceramics, silver and glassware. The collections are of national and international significance and are of Designated Status.

The specific activities are detailed below:

April 11-14 What do artists do?

<http://www.ofsted.gov.uk/reports/108/108480.pdf>

<http://www.twmuseums.org.uk/laing/>(accessed 20/4/2006)

Pupils visited the Laing to look at contemporary and historical art and begin discussion about art, artists and the studio visits.

Summer term week beginning 25 April 2005 Artists in the City

Eight half-day visits/workshops were arranged for pupils with the artist studios at 36 Lime Street, Newcastle. Pupils were given the opportunity to explore the ways in which artists' lives and work are influenced/inspired by their environment, in this case the inner city. Pupils participated in question and answer sessions and hands-on art activities and documented their visits and findings using project books and blue digital cameras.

Summer term week beginning 11 July 2005 Artists in the countryside

Eight half-day visits/workshops were arranged for pupils through the Tynedale artists' network, Northumberland. The aim of this was to give pupils the opportunity to explore the ways in which artists' lives and work are influenced/inspired by their environment, in this case the Northumberland countryside. Pupils participated in a hands-on activity and question and answer sessions with the artists. The pupils documented their visits and findings using project books and blue digital cameras.

The exercise evaluated was part of the Artists in the Country project. It involved pupils from Thomas Walling Primary School visiting an artist (Jim Dearden) working in his studio in Ashington, Northumberland. The activity involved the pupils making simple animation in the form of thaumatropes and kinographs (flicker books).

The project fits in with the specific aims of the Laing Art Gallery of working with local communities and increasing participation and providing opportunities for audiences to engage with and understand art.

The learning outcomes for the pupils were:

- To develop knowledge and understanding of the work of artists
- To explore the meaning and place of the artist in society
- To learn to respond to and evaluate art
- To develop investigation and communication skills
- To learn new skills
- To encourage creativity, inspiration and enjoyment

The learning outcomes for teachers were:

- To provide inspiration for follow up work done as part of the project
- To develop increased confidence in working with artists and the gallery

- To provide an opportunity to share and develop ideas with other teachers, artists and gallery staff
- To achieve repeat visits to gallery as individuals or with class

Thomas Walling Primary School was last inspected in January 2003; it is bigger than most primaries and admits pupils aged three to 11. It is situated in a large estate of, mainly, local authority-owned housing on the west side of the City of Newcastle upon Tyne. There is very high unemployment and a high level of deprivation. The school is housed in a modern building on two sites. There are now 360 pupils on roll, with 173 boys and 152 girls in the main school and 35 pupils who attend the nursery part-time. Children enter the nursery with a broad range of attainment but most have very low language, literacy and social skills for their age. The school is part of an Education Action Zone (EAZ) and has been chosen for a Sure Start site aimed at developing pre-school education and links with parents. There are seven pupils identified as having English as an additional language, all are at an early stage of acquiring English. There are eight pupils from asylum seeking families. 59% of pupils are eligible for free school meals, well above the national average.

The Ofsted inspection report states:

'Thomas Walling Primary School provides a satisfactory education for all its pupils. However, there are some weaknesses. The leadership and management of the school are mainly sound and the acting head teacher has worked well with the governing body to begin to identify needed improvements. In past years, key staff have had a very limited role in identifying, managing and monitoring the implementation of priorities. The effectiveness of many initiatives has not been evaluated sufficiently over time to ensure their impact on the work of the school. Teaching is satisfactory overall, with good teaching in the nursery and reception classes (the Foundation Stage), and in Year 2. Although standards by the age of 11 are well below average in English and mathematics, there are high numbers of pupils with special educational needs in the current Year 6 and this adversely affects the school's performance.'

5.1 BALTIC Centre for Contemporary Art² (2)

Housed in an ex-industrial building on the south bank of the River Tyne in Gateshead, BALTIC is the biggest gallery of its kind in the world, presenting an international programme of contemporary visual art. BALTIC has no permanent collection.

The BALTIC is funded by Arts Council England, North East; Gateshead Council; European Regional Development Fund; and English Partnerships through One North East (the North East Regional Development Agency). One third of BALTIC's income is raised through corporate sponsorship, support from individuals and charitable organisations, directly contributing to its programme and education work.

5.2 High Spen Primary School Project

For enquire, a class from High Spen School visited BALTIC and took part in a workshop with Miles Thurlow (BALTIC Freelance Artist) who then delivered a session at the school.

² <http://www.balticmill.com/index.php> [accessed 20/4/2006]

Twenty Year 6 pupils came to BALTIC with teacher Ruth Whiteside. For nearly all of the pupils it was their first visit to BALTIC. The pupils worked in a studio session exploring materials and the sculptural form. Within the visit the pupils also had exhibition tours of all of the galleries and an exploration of the quayside.

As a follow up to the BALTIC visit, Miles Thurlow ran a studio session at High Spen School on 19 April working with the same 20 Year 6 pupils and with teacher Ruth Whiteside. No special groups were targeted.

The aim of the project was to develop relationships with High Spen Primary School. The project supports the BALTIC's mission which is to:

- Encourage and support people of all ages to explore, experience, create, enjoy, be challenged by and participate in the art of our time

The intended learning outcomes of the project were:

- Practical ways of working with an artist in their school and at BALTIC
- Continuing to work with the same group of pupils so that they are comfortable in a gallery setting working with contemporary art as their starting point

The intended learning outcomes for the teachers involved were:

- Benefits of being involved with research

High Spen Primary School has 145 pupils on roll, and a further 18 children attend an attached nursery. The pupils come from a wide range of backgrounds. Attainment on entry is varied but below the average for the Education Authority. Nearly all pupils are white and British. A higher than average number of families move into or leave the area each year. The school was last inspected³ in January/February 2006 the report states:

'The school stands at the very heart of the community and is held in high esteem by parents, pupils and the local authority. Good teaching is the norm. This leads to pupils learning well from the start of the Foundation Stage. The curriculum is good and includes many exciting activities. Exceptional care and guidance contribute to pupils' outstanding personal development and well-being. It is especially effective in aiding the emotional development of children in the Foundation Stage, preparing them particularly well for entering Year 1. The school recognised that 'every child matters' long before the phrase became so well publicised.'

5.3 ISIS Arts⁴ (4)

ISIS Arts develops and manages artist-led residencies, exhibitions and events. With an active new media studio, ISIS provides a valuable environment for the creation of new media artwork. ISIS Arts is a not-for-profit organisation and receives revenue funding from Arts Council England, North East; Northumberland County Council; and Newcastle City Council. Our new media studio has been made possible by support from the Lottery and Northern Rock Foundation.

5.4 Big M Media Labs Project

³ http://www.ofsted.gov.uk/reports/108/s5_108340_20060131.pdf [accessed 20/4/2006]

⁴ <http://www.isisarts.org.uk/index2.html> [accessed 20/4/2006] The 'Big M' is an inflatable gallery space that is taken to various venues.

The project centred on the inflatable gallery the 'Big M' and involved artist/ teacher/ student labs to produce new media work. The project involved a group of young people from Berwick Community High School⁵. These consisted of two groups working together, one group taking 'A' levels and the other taking GNVQs and about to leave school. The project involved these pupils making video art together with artist Kelly Richardson. The project was planned to coincide with Berwick Film Festival, part of which involved the 'Big M' showing video art.

The project supports the organisation's mission statement:

- To promote access, experience and understanding of contemporary arts practice.
To produce high quality artistic and educational experience.

The intended learning outcomes of the project for pupils were:

- To gain experience and understanding of contemporary arts practice.
- To gain access and ownership of art as culture.

The intended outcomes for teachers were:

- To gain experience and understanding of contemporary arts practice.

Berwick Community High School is a comprehensive school that was last inspected in October 2001. It is situated on the south side of the River Tweed, and serves the town of Berwick and the rural communities in the locality. There are 787 pupils aged 13 to 18 years, 396 boys and 391 girls. The school is virtually the sole provider for Sixth Form pupils in the region and offers a good range of AS and A Levels subjects, but a small range of vocational qualifications at present. About 10% of pupils have special educational needs (SEN), of which 3% have a statement. 11.4% of pupils are entitled to free school meals, which is below average. The area the school serves is mixed, with some significant social deprivation. The most recent Ofsted report states:

'This is an improving school although some of the improvements have only begun recently. Through determined and purposeful educational leadership and management the school is now effective in promoting good behaviour and positive attitudes and relationships. However, it has yet to see the benefits of the new approaches to improving students' attainment reflected in examinations and test results. It is now providing an overall satisfactory quality of education for its pupils.'

5.5 Laing Art Gallery⁶

The Laing Art Gallery is part of Tyne and Wear Museums which is a federation of 11 museums and galleries on Tyneside and Wearside. Collectively, they attract over one million visitors a year (1,277,739) in 2002/2003). The Laing was founded in 1901 by Alexander Laing, a Scottish wine and spirit merchant. The building was opened in 1904. The Laing houses an extensive collection of British oil paintings, watercolours, ceramics, silver and glassware. The collections are of national and international significance and are of Designated Status.

The specific activities are detailed below:

⁵ <http://www.berwickhighschool.co.uk/> [accessed 20/4/2006]

⁶ <http://www.twmuseums.org.uk/laing/> [accessed 20/4/2006]

April 11-14 What do artists do?

Pupils visited the Laing to look at contemporary and historical art and begin discussion about art, artists and the studio visits.

Summer term week beginning 25 April 2005 Artists in the City

Eight half-day visits/workshops were arranged for pupils with the artist studios at 36 Lime Street, Newcastle. Pupils were given the opportunity to explore the ways in which artists' lives and work are influenced/inspired by their environment, in this case the inner city. Pupils participated in question and answer sessions and hands-on art activities and documented their visits and findings using project books and blue digital cameras.

Summer term week beginning 11 July 2005 Artists in the countryside

Eight half-day visits/workshops were arranged for pupils through the Tynedale artists' network, Northumberland. The aim of this was to give pupils the opportunity to explore the ways in which in which artists' lives and work are influenced/inspired by their environment, in this case the Northumberland countryside. Pupils participated in a hands-on activity and question and answer sessions with the artists. The pupils documented their visits and findings using project books and blue digital cameras.

The exercise evaluated was part of the Artists in the Country project. It involved pupils from Thomas Walling Primary School visiting an artist (Jim Dearden) working in his studio in Ashington, Northumberland. The activity involved the pupils making simple animation in the form of thaumatropes and kinographs (flicker books).

The project fits in with the specific aims of the Laing Art Gallery of working with local communities and increasing participation and providing opportunities for audiences to engage with and understand art.

The learning outcomes for the pupils were:

- To develop knowledge and understanding of the work of artists
- To explore the meaning and place of the artist in society
- To learn to respond to and evaluate art
- To develop investigation and communication skills
- To learn new skills
- To encourage creativity, inspiration and enjoyment

The learning outcomes for teachers were:

- To provide inspiration for follow up work done as part of the project
- To develop increased confidence in working with artists and the gallery
- To provide an opportunity to share and develop ideas with other teachers, artists and gallery staff
- To achieve repeat visits to gallery as individuals or with class

Thomas Walling Primary School was last inspected in January 2003; it is bigger than most primaries and admits pupils aged three to 11. It is situated in a large estate of, mainly, local authority-owned housing on the west side of the City of Newcastle upon Tyne. There is very high unemployment and a high level of deprivation. The school is housed in a modern

building on two sites. There are now 360 pupils on roll, with 173 boys and 152 girls in the main school and 35 pupils who attend the nursery part-time. Children enter the nursery with a broad range of attainment but most have very low language, literacy and social skills for their age. The school is part of an Education Action Zone (EAZ) and has been chosen for a Sure Start site aimed at developing pre-school education and links with parents. There are seven pupils identified as having English as an additional language, all are at an early stage of acquiring English. There are eight pupils from asylum seeking families. 59% of pupils are eligible for free school meals, well above the national average.

The Ofsted inspection report states:

'Thomas Walling Primary School provides a satisfactory education for all its pupils. However, there are some weaknesses. The leadership and management of the school are mainly sound and the acting head teacher has worked well with the governing body to begin to identify needed improvements. In past years, key staff have had a very limited role in identifying, managing and monitoring the implementation of priorities. The effectiveness of many initiatives has not been evaluated sufficiently over time to ensure their impact on the work of the school. Teaching is satisfactory overall, with good teaching in the nursery and reception classes (the Foundation Stage), and in Year 2. Although standards by the age of 11 are well below average in English and mathematics, there are high numbers of pupils with special educational needs in the current Year 6 and this adversely affects the school's performance.'

6.0 Methodology

Research question

How do gallery learning activities contribute to participants' development of capital?

The above research question has been used to address the aim of the enquire programme – to explore and identify the conditions for maximising the transformative potential of gallery education for young people.

The research has been qualitative in approach, which is considered the most appropriate method for the analysis of complex feelings and attitudes. The methodologies used consisted of interviews and focus groups. These took between 35-120 minutes and were digitally recorded and then transcribed. The resulting transcripts were analysed using QSR **full name?** (Nvivo 1.20VIVO) software, which is designed to identify patterns within the data. The projects have been fully documented and images and video used when possible.

The data collection and analysis were guided by frameworks derived from the constructs of human, cultural and social capital, as explored in section 2. As stated therein, the forms of capital, while distinct, are related. For example, investments in social and human capital might result in forms of cultural capital that have a range of benefits to the individual and group.

In order to resolve the research question it is important to determine the impact of the involvement in gallery learning activities on participants' lives as far as possible given the timescale and the qualitative mode of research. Therefore, the research consisted of three main elements. Firstly, a 'baseline' upon which the rest of the research can be grounded was established. In order to do this the amount and types of capital held by respondents was

determined. The nature of the participants' cultural consumption and their knowledge of, and attitudes towards, contemporary art was explored. This involved developing an understanding of participants' home and social lives. Data was collected using focus groups or semi-structured interviews (the researcher used a series of questions, some of which would be common to other interviews to provide a point of comparison). The sort of baseline questions asked related to:

6.1 Children and family groups

- Work / educational attainment
- Neighbours/membership of organisations/volunteering
- Socialising
- Transport
- Housing
- Trust/community life
- Health
- Politics/voting
- Belonging
- Motivation/confidence
- Alienation
- Activities/leisure time
- Art Galleries
- Attitudes/knowledge about art (esp. contemporary)

In particular, two interrogative frameworks were developed for use within focus groups. The first of these aimed to capture data relating to capital in broad ways; the second relates specifically to the practice, consumption and understanding of art. While the frameworks guided data collection, it was not possible (or desirable) to use them in a rigid way. The semi-structured nature of discussion meant that some topics were not encountered in the order suggested below; also, the age of the subjects influenced which of these lines of enquiry were pursued and how questions were framed. The final question in interrogative framework 1 was intended to act as a bridge into interrogative framework 2, which is articulated in pre-activity and post-activity configurations in order to capture data relating to shifts in capital over time.

6.2 Table 1: focus group interrogative framework 1

Work / educational attainment	Attitudes towards school – like / dislike
Socialising	Friends – how often see them? Where?
Organised leisure/participation	Clubs; Scouts; dance; sport; church etc. Parental involvement?
Transport	Car at home? How do you get about? Is it easy?
Housing	Experience of crime?

Health	In good health?
Belonging	What do you feel about where you live?
Motivations / esteem	Do things on own? What things do you think you are good at? How do they make you feel?
Alienation	When and where do you feel uncomfortable?
Activities/leisure time	What do you like to do?
Politics/voting	What do you think about politics, the political parties and voting? Who do you think you might vote for in future?
Art Galleries	Have you been to an art gallery before? With whom? Why? How did you feel about it? How frequently do you visit?

6.3. Table 2: focus group interrogative framework 2

Pre-activity	Post-activity
What do you think about art?	Did you enjoy the activity? Why?
Do you like doing art? Why?	What did you do with the work you produced?
What artists do you know? Do you know any who are still alive?	Did you do any others? How many? With whom? Did you show them to anyone?
Do you have a favourite artwork?	What was the technique you were using? (e.g. animation)
Do you watch TV programmes about art? Which ones? How often?	Do you know how else that technique is used?
What do you know about the activity next week with the artist? What do you expect? Are you looking forward to it?	Did you enjoy working with the artist and with others? In what ways?
How do you think artists work?	What did you think about the way s/he worked?
What will you ask the artist?	What did you ask the artist?
Would you like to be an artist?	Would you like to be an artist?

Further data was collected through semi-structured interviews with teachers, artists and gallery education officers (although in fact only one of the three artists was available for interview). Here, questions included:

6.4 Teachers/facilitators/Artists

Success in learning outcomes

- Success in learning outcomes
 - Perceived impact, e.g. change in behaviour –transformative impact
 - Relationship to existing classroom work
 - The ways in which this project is different from others
 - The impact of context
 - Whether pupils gained satisfaction from the project
 -
 - Whether pupils demonstrated increased confidence in gallery context and increased self-esteem
- Whether teachers/facilitators/artists would change anything if the activity were to be repeated

Further data was collected through (non-participant) observations of the activities in which the pupils engaged.

It should be noted that the qualitative mode of research, and, in particular, the reliance on data from focus groups and interviews, meant that the coding of data is dependent on the researchers' judgment. The subjectivities and personal interpretive acts involved in this must be acknowledged, particularly when dealing with very young subjects whose articulacy is relatively undeveloped. However, researchers undertook blind inter-coding and achieved high levels of congruence. In addition, the short timescale did not always aid in the identification of shifts in capital formations, which can be complex, slow and accumulative processes; this gives researchers' observations a somewhat speculative cast on occasions (although this is not to imply that such observations are without value in the context of the aims of this research).

It is also important to clarify that, given the small number of subjects involved in the research, the data and analysis cannot be generalised. This is also a consequence of the unique (if not bespoke) nature of the gallery education activities undertaken as part of the programme. However, it can be stated that subjects' responses and/or actions indicate *possibilities* within specific circumstances, in a fashion similar to the emphasis in some qualitative research on *social practices which are possible* rather than on universally generalisable data (Peräklyä 2004).

The qualitative mode was adopted primarily because of the complexities of the research questions, which are not amenable to quantitative interrogation. In order to capture data relating to individuals' affective responses to complex experiences, it was necessary to adopt methodologies that allowed subjects to express themselves as freely and at as much length as possible, rather than being constrained by the limitations of a questionnaire or other surveying methods. The consequences of this approach are that no quantitative information has been generated and that no attempt has been made to classify or typologise individual subjects through their responses or behaviour. Rather, the aim has been to

provide a rich sense of the complexity of subjects' lives, experiences and values and the importance of gallery-based learning activities to these.

6.5 Data collected

School/Lead organisation	Date	Activity	Researchers	Notes
Berwick upon Tweed Community High School	15/9/2005	Pre-event interviews with participants, 12 pupils	Andrew Newman Iain Wheeldon	
	20/9/2005	Activity review visit. Observation of 12 pupils and artist working	Andrew Newman Iain Wheeldon	
	16/2/2006	Post-visit interviews with participants, 12 pupils	Anna Goulding	
	16/2/2006	Interview with teacher Martin Paterson	Anna Goulding	
John Quinn ISIS Arts	11/4/2006	Interview	Chris Whitehead Andrew Newman	

School/Lead organisation	Date	Activity	Researchers	Notes
Thomas Walling Primary School Pre - activity	8/7/2005	Pre-activity interviews with participants - 4 pupils	Andrew Newman Chris Whitehead Iain Wheeldon	
	9/7/2005	Interview with teacher	Andrew Newman Chris Whitehead Iain Wheeldon	
	9/7/2005	Activity observation 30 pupils working with Artist	Andrew Newman Chris Whitehead	
	19/7/2005	Post-visit interviews with participants,	Andrew Newman Chris Whitehead	

		10 pupils		
Becky Davis Laing Art Gallery	13/4/2006	Interview	Andrew Newman Chris Whitehead	

School/Lead organisation	Date	Activity	Researchers	Notes
High Spen Primary School	31/10/05	Pre-activity interviews with participants	Chris Whitehead Iain Wheeldon	
	8/11/05	Activity observation Pupils working with Artist	Chris Whitehead Iain Wheeldon	
	29/11/2005	Post-visit interviews with participants	Chris Whitehead	
	29/11/2005	Interview with teacher	Chris Whitehead	Mini-disc recorder failed – notes taken
Judy Thomas BALTIC	13/4/2006	Interview	Chris Whitehead Andrew Newman	

7.0 Discussion of findings

This section discusses the findings relating to each of the projects in turn. Each case study will commence with an examination of schoolchildren's existing levels of capital, drawing on data from focus groups with the pupils and from the interviews with teachers. They will then proceed to identify and analyse shifts in capital on the basis of data collected during the observation of activity and subsequent focus groups with schoolchildren; where appropriate this discussion will also refer to additional data collected through subsequent interviews with teachers, artists and gallery education officers.

It is clear from the data that the activities under consideration in each of the following case studies were part of a series in which the pupils had been involved. This means that shifts in capital, contingent upon these single activities, are difficult to segregate from ongoing processes of accumulation, and caution is required when trying to identify *discrete* shifts arising from one event. Shifts in capital need to be contextualised in relation to a broader network of events and in relation to broader longitudinal timescales than this research project was able to focus upon.

7.1 'What do Artists do?' Laing Art Gallery and Thomas Walling Primary School

It was evident from the data collected using the first interrogative framework (see methodology above) that the schoolchildren's capital formation was complex and varied. All pupils lived in the immediate area of the school and expressed positive feelings about where they lived. The schoolchildren came from diverse family backgrounds: most, but not all, of

the pupils' parents were employed, examples of occupations being: careworker, printer, bar worker, retail worker and fish and chip shop worker. There were low levels of car ownership and pupils stated that they moved outside of their immediate environment infrequently; for example their visits with family to Newcastle city centre were infrequent, and when they did visit it was primarily for the purpose of shopping, but some had visited the Laing Art Gallery and the BAL TIC Centre for Contemporary Art with their parents. However, the pupils did travel with family for other purposes, primarily to visit relatives elsewhere; for example:

'me brother used to be in the army so I used to go out to like Catterick and Ireland and everywhere to see him.'

The pupils had active social lives, and all were involved in organised leisure activities of various kinds, including playing for a football club, gymnastics, 'girls club'⁷ and break dancing club. Unstructured leisure activities mentioned by pupils included playing computer games, roller skating and sketching. Family relations, and in particular sibling relations, were also highly important in terms of socialising and spending leisure time. Pupils' attitude to school was mixed, but all were positive about their engagement with art in school and their attendance on trips and 'fun days'. As pupils drawn from the Gifted and Talented Art Register⁸ they gave the impression of being highly motivated and confident in their abilities in relation to artistic practice; notably, all of them were frequent viewers of art-based TV programmes such as Art Attack and SmART. Prior to the visit to the artist's gallery and studio, the pupils had been on organised visits to the Laing Art Gallery and to Lime Street Studios in Newcastle city centre.

The second interrogative framework focused specifically on the pupils' understandings and attitudes to art in relation to forms of capital (see section 5.2). When asked to recollect the names of artists they were able to mention Van Gogh, Monet and Paul Klee, all of whom had been covered within class work at the school. They also mentioned favourite works of art, including *Van Gogh's Chair*, Sam Taylor-Wood's *A Little Death* and William Holman Hunt's *Isabella and the Pot of Basil*. All of these were then on display at the Laing Art Gallery which the pupils had visited the day before the focus group. While this demonstrates a positive experience of engaging with art within the gallery it may also suggest that pupils had relatively limited stocks of art historical knowledge, and the capital which this represents, upon which to draw, as they only mentioned works of art which had been seen very recently. (However, it should be noted that the ability to recollect artists' names or particular works of art cannot be taken to be emblematic of their art historical awareness and understandings in general.) Pupils' understandings of artistic practices were mostly related to traditional technologies and media (e.g. sculpture and painting. When asked what artists do, pupils responded:

- [S/he] paints...does little sketches, and maybe just go out and paint pictures sometimes.

- Just ask people to stand there and paint them.

- Painters might make some colours, different colours

⁷ 'We go there and we get... we do this song, and we get to write poems for we mams, and we get to play, there's loads of games there.'

⁸ However, as a result of school policy the children were unaware that they were classified as 'gifted and talented'.

- They might ...when they go out they might find a big block of wood and like carve something out of it.

Other responses included references to less conventional forms of making:

- Sometimes they just take pictures and sketch over them.

- They could pick things up what they find, and then they could like make... when they get back they could make like collages out of them.

In terms of artistic processes, pupils discussed the ways in which artists generate and develop ideas:

- They might just ... be doing something and they might be another artist painting it and they think that looks like a good idea.

- They might just have a nice feeling and just want to...

- They could just be walking round, and they could just, they could go like into an art gallery and get... and see a painting and they could think that they're going to do something like that.

- They could do it in their imagination.

- They could do the still life projects that's going on down at an art gallery.

- They might see someone doing a painting or drawing or something and like get inspiration from it.

This may suggest that the pupils tended to see certain artistic processes in terms of their own experiences, in that a frequent pedagogical framework used within the school was exposure to an artist's work or a body of art (e.g. 'Chinese Art', 'Aboriginal art', 'Origami' etc.) followed by the development and production of new work. In relation to intellectual approaches to making art, pupils showed limited understanding of, and engagement with, abstraction and conceptual approaches. For example, in discussing their own work, pupils gave much emphasis to drawing realistically and accurately, privileging a view of art rooted in notions of skill and imitation:

- Sometimes if me brother and his girlfriend go out and they get their picture taken or something, I like doing a sketch and see if I can get it to look like it.

- I just watch like a cartoon, and just try to draw it, like get the shapes right.

Also, it was evident from comments made by the pupils' teacher that they found it difficult to think in terms of experimentation, trial and error and risk taking. In particular, pupils were encouraged to work in sketch pads in an experimental fashion (their work in the pads was not assessed):

- None of my class are very good with their sketch books, they're all quite frightened of making mistakes in them, and whereas you know, I just want them to... I don't even mark their sketchbooks, they're just there because I want them to be messy in them and experiment.

The teacher was subsequently asked whether she encouraged pupils explicitly to make use of their sketchbooks in this way and to see that making 'mistakes' is acceptable:

Yeah, yeah. That's what I want their sketchbooks to be. Because I did...I did Art A Level and degree, so I think that's the way that they should be used purely just to experiment in, and ... but they find that really, really hard, much harder than sitting with a... a piece of paper and drawing their finished piece, just actually being allowed to make mistakes and stuff seems to be something they really struggle with.

Pupils also demonstrated a marked ability to use their experiences of making art. For example, when discussing Van Gogh's depression in relation to his artistic practice, the following exchange took place:

- When I'm not happy I just draw a nice picture.

[Interviewer] *- And that cheers you up?*

- Yeah.

This indicates an instrumental and therapeutic use of making art within the personal context of affect. Other pupils made use of art in order to alleviate boredom:

Sometimes if I'm just feeling bored and me brother is on me [computer] game or something, I would, I would...I would probably just grab my sketch book and do a drawing.

During the interview the teacher noted that the pupils had shown no signs of feeling intimidated or anxious before or during their school visits to galleries, indicating a relative lack of awareness of the codes and norms of behaviour associated with the art gallery which can become intimidating and exclusive in later life; their comments on the use of galleries by artists also demonstrate an understanding of the gallery as a resource for current art practice.

Pupils' art production had a complex relation with socialising and socialisation. In the domestic environment pupils' engagement with making art appeared to be a relatively solitary experience based on sketching and drawing, although there were instances in which this involved social contact in some form, for example through sketching from photographs of family members, or through asking family members for help:

- I used to watch a cartoon, I used to love it but I couldn't draw that well then so I used to get me ma to draw it and I used to colour it in.

On the other hand, art activities within school activities, and especially within gallery-based work, did involve significant socialising. While the teacher noted that ordinary classwork involved a high level of interaction, she made particular reference to one activity held at BALTIC Centre for Contemporary Art which she had seen as significant in relation to socialisation:

- When we went we... when I did this workshop with them there was about seven different schools there, and I thought at first because there's a couple that I took that are quite sort of shy and not very confident anyway, and I was a bit worried that 'cause

there were so many schools there they perhaps wouldn't mix well together, and they did, they like... within like a couple of minutes like all the schools had all mixed together, and they were all like working together, and moving round these stations, which... it was really good actually, 'cause I didn't think they would've... do that at all. They mixed a lot more easily with all of those children than perhaps they do even within their own sort year group at school.

The teacher also discussed the very particular opportunity for investing in social capital represented by the segregation of the 'Gifted and Talented' pupils from the rest of the class for specific gallery visits and activities:

I mean whenever they [i.e. the 'Gifted and Talented' children] like, come back into the classroom after they've been they always want to like discuss with the rest of the class what they've done. And I know they went on one particular one where they did origami I think, and they actually came back and had their own little workshop thing where they taught... like taught it to the rest of the children. So we had them like on two ta- three tables, and they did the teaching to the group, which was really, really nice.

[Interviewer] *Was that their initiative?*

Yeah, yeah they wanted to because they came and showed what they'd done to the rest of the class, and the rest of the class is quite impressed, and they actually came and asked me if it would be alright if they showed the rest of the class how to do it, so we spent an afternoon letting them teach which was fun, it was nice.

This can be seen as a particularised investment in social capital by way of the reconfiguration of a specific social network (i.e. the assumption of a pedagogical role on the part of some pupils within the classroom) and the sharing of new skills for mutual benefit. The benefit for the class was the acquisition of new artistic skills, and the benefit for the 'Gifted and Talented' pupils was the opportunity to demonstrate their artistic ability, to take control of a teaching and learning situation, and to play an authoritative role, all of which may have had a positive impact on self-image, identity and self-confidence.

Pupils showed a good understanding of the role of art in professional and economic life and in terms of material culture and consumption. When questioned about their views of the importance of art in these contexts, responses included:

- 'cause like if...if you're going to be a builder or something when you're older, you need to get a design for your house or whatever. And if you're not a very good drawer your design will just look rubbish.

- You would need to know art if you were a printer, because if you didn't know how to mix the colours, or how to work any machines.

- Everything is design, even this table.

However, none of the pupils aimed at a career involving art: career aims at this stage included: 'a nurse or a doctor'; 'vet'; 'footballer'; 'playing in a band'; 'mechanic'. One pupil noted that:

- I would like... if I couldn't get a job in anything else I would try and be a cartoonist or something.

And another stated that he would wish to continue to make art as a hobby.

7.2 Shifts in capital in relation to 'What do Artists do?'

The activity involved a visit to the gallery and studio of the artist Jim Dearden in Ashington, a small ex-mining town in the south of Northumberland. Notably, the visit took place in the afternoon, as the school group had spent the morning at Plessey Woods – a nearby nature reserve. During the gallery activity the artist demonstrated basic animation techniques to the pupils (thaumatropes and kinographs), whereupon the pupils produced their own work using these techniques. The activity included year 5 pupils as well as others from years 2, 3 and 4.

An attempt was made to introduce the artist's professional practice to the pupils and to discuss this with them, but because of numbers and time constraints this was limited in nature, the majority of the session being dedicated to the animation exercise. The education officer responsible for brokering this project noted that a specific aim was to 'humanise' art by introducing schoolchildren to living artists and to their artistic practice and to stimulate their engagement with art as a consequence – to enable them to learn, as she put it, '*about who artists are, what they do, what their practice is and what kind of art they produce:*

one of the things that was on the original proposal was the kind of the the shock that not all artists are dead people, they're alive and they still... they still make a living by you know, making art and selling it as well.'

The most identifiable shifts in capital related to:

- an increased knowledge and understanding of the techniques and everyday importance of animation as an artistic medium, and
- social interaction and a risk-taking approach to making art.

It was evident that pupils responded very positively to the activity, and reflected on their own work with a sense of achievement:

- It was good when we made them... the ... the little ... the paper, and you had to draw a picture on each side, a happy face or a sad face, and then you put a pencil on it and just keep on...

- [Interviewer] And it worked, didn't it?

- Mm hmm. Good!

And:

- On the front [my thaumatrope] had a dog with its ears down, and another one had a one with its ears up.

- I had a dog where... I had a dog that was eating his food, and then when I thingied it it was there and then it wasn't. Like the food kept disappearing.

Upon enquiry it emerged that the pupils had experimented further with the techniques introduced during the activity in their free time at home, although their endeavours were directed towards perfecting their drawings rather than diversifying in terms of subject matter:

- [Interviewer] *Was the second one you did the same –was it still a dog?*

- *It was the same but I drew it better, without rushing.*

And:

- *I copied off the same [inaudible] and made it better.*

However, some of the pupils noted that their engagement with this technique had ended here:

- [Interviewer] *Do you think you'll do any more animation in your free time?*

- *Do something else.*

Most significantly in terms of human capital, the pupils were clearly able to understand the relationship between the basic animation techniques which they had learned and animation within popular culture and everyday life. For example, they made links between their activity and TV and film animation (e.g. The Simpsons, Jimmy Neutron, Toy Story, Finding Nemo, Shrek etc.) and with the Smart board animation which they saw used in classroom activities. In this sense it was clear that the pupils had developed some understanding of the places of animation within popular and professional culture. However, the pupils' engagement in the animation activity did not necessarily increase their ability to 'decode' other types of artwork or to behave comfortably and confidently around them. The Laing education officer noted that on a visit to the 'Revelation' exhibition (subsequent to the data collection period), the pupils had showed some uncertainty about how to interpret and understand the works on show (by artists such as Damien Hirst, Grayson Perry, Rachel Whiteread etc.):

I think when they went to see the artist at the artist's studios, that was you know, obviously they were kind of... you know, they were real people and they could see the art they made and ask people questions about that, but then the groups that came to the Revelation exhibition, that was certainly something, because some of the things to them was so you know, not what they'd perhaps had... had when they first [inaudible] to the Laing seen as being the kind of the art that we had there, then you know, it was much harder I think to get them to discuss and so you know, you have to you know, say things like it's okay if you don't like it, you can say that and say why you don't like it, or if it reminds you of a drainpipe nobody's going to say that's wrong. I think that was very interesting that it was you know, the groups that had been you know, confident you know, when we went out on the visit, and when we first came to the art gallery were kind of less so with the Revelation exhibition.

Social interaction was a prominent feature of the pupils' behaviour during the activity itself, and in particular researchers observed numerous instances in which pupils shared and compared the results of their efforts and positively critiqued one another's work. In relation to social capital this can be seen as bonding. During the focus group, pupils discussed their views of the importance of this for the success of the activity:

A. it wouldn't have been as good if it was by yourself.

B: *'cause everyone was wanting to look at your work to see what it was like, and everything, and you were having a look at other people's.*

A: *And if you thought it was horrible, everyone still says it's really good.*

From this, and from observation, it appeared that the socially supportive atmosphere which had emerged may have enabled them to engage in more experimental work, in particular when they had begun to replicate the activity after their first attempts. In this context it is useful to recall the pupils' anxiety about making mistakes which their teacher had identified. In a related comment, the teacher also noted that the pupils who were most willing to adopt artistic approaches relating to risk-taking and trial and error had been involved in a previous gallery activity, highlighting the importance of institutional and social support for enabling pupils to think in this way:

And the ones that have been, seem to be a little more keen to do that, because I think they got given sketch books at some point from the... from the Laing Art Gallery, yeah where they were allowed to do whatever they wanted to do in them. And they seemed more comfortable, the ones that had been using their sketchbooks that we've got now.

Schoolchildren also noted that they had shown examples of their animation work to their parents, which also reflects a process of bonding. This relates to the perceived special status of work associated with creativity, and the corollary importance of showing finished artworks to parents or other family members for the purposes of self-expression, demonstrating the development of one's skills, abilities and personality and eliciting and receiving praise.

7.3 'Comfortable and Uncomfortable Spaces': High Spen and BALTIC Centre for Contemporary Art

All pupils involved in the evaluation lived in the immediate area of the school and expressed positive feelings about where they lived. Responses to the first interrogative framework showed that the schoolchildren came from diverse family backgrounds. All of the pupils' parents were employed, examples of occupations being: careworker; administrator; engineer; television engineer; parking administrator; nurse; landscape gardener; and hairdresser. Pupils stated that they moved outside of their immediate environment frequently, often visiting art galleries (e.g. Laing, Shipley, BALTIC) and museums (e.g. the Discovery Museum) with their families as well as visiting parks, taking picnics and walks, camping and shopping. It was evident that some of the pupils' families were extended, included step-sisters and step-brothers.

The pupils had full social lives. Organised leisure activities included playing for a football club, swimming, ballet, jazz and disco dancing. Unstructured leisure involved playing with siblings and other pupils from the neighbourhood in the streets and the nearby woods. Notably, one of the pupils discussed how she spent some leisure time watching her sister, who was studying for a degree in fashion at Edinburgh College of Art, producing artworks.

The pupils' attitudes to school were mixed, and subjects such as maths were unpopular; however, they were highly positive about art and Design and Technology:

A - *Ah I love art.*

B - Yeah I love art.

[All] - Yeah.

C - Art and DT are the best, Art and DT are the best.

D - Yeah they're cool.

E - Yeah. ICT and Art.

[Interviewer] - Right, so you all like Art.

D - Well Art and DT are kind of the same things aren't they?

A - Yeah.

C - The only bummer in Design and Technology's where you've got to write your plans down.

One individual explained her enjoyment of art as follows:

- I like it 'cause you just mess on, and at the end you've made this wicked picture... when you're finished and you let it dry and it looks wicked, all the swirls and like curls...

The pupils were not drawn from the Gifted and Talented Art Register, but still gave the impression of being highly motivated and confident in their abilities in relation to artistic practice; notably, all of them were frequent viewers of art-based TV programmes such as Art Attack and SmART. When asked to recollect or discuss artists or artworks of interest they were able to mention Picasso, Whistler's *Arrangement in Grey and Black, No 1 (The Artist's Mother)*, Anthony Gormley and Chinese watercolour painting. Prior to the visit to the artist's gallery and studio, the pupils had been on organised visits to the Shipley Art Gallery in Gateshead Town Centre and to Seven Stories: the Centre for the Children's Book in Newcastle City centre.

The pupils also had experience of working with art across the curriculum; for example, their teacher had used Henri Rousseau's *Surprise!* in the context of an overarching school focus on the rainforest. She also noted that pupils were used to working collaboratively and that art activities facilitated positive social interaction:

if... you're working with a bunch of children... a group... if you split your class into groups, and they're working on a large piece, whether it's a large sculpture or a large chalk drawing or whatever it might be, I mean that... that's really good for cooperative learning and social bonding, because obviously they're having to negotiate, they're having to negotiate who's doing what, how you know, from how heavy the brushstrokes are to whatever [inaudible] you know. So that's...there is definitely a case to be made for that, that social bonding does go on within the group setting.

7.4 Shifts in capital in relation to 'Comfortable and Uncomfortable Spaces'

The project involved artist-led activities in class at school and then at BALTIC Centre for Contemporary Art. During the classroom-based activity, the artist Miles Thurlow (assisted by a member of education staff at BALTIC) encouraged the pupils to create comfortable and

uncomfortable spaces using the furniture available; after this, the pupils were given materials with which to make models of comfortable spaces in groups. These exercises were linked to the theme of collaboration, teamwork and cooperation between the pupils. This related to specific initiatives at the School, including the development of a 'buddy space' in which pupils were intended to engage in peer counselling. The activities in this sense concerned, to some extent, the interrelationships between physical space and human interaction and wellbeing. At BALTIC the pupils visited British Art Show 6 in the company of an artist before working, in one of the gallery's education spaces, on a model city/urban environment. The education officer involved in brokering this project stated that specific aims included creating links between BALTIC and the school and creating links between art activities and new practices at the school including the aforementioned 'buddy space' scheme.

The most identifiable shifts in capital related to:

- Increased awareness of the nature of space and its affective qualities,
- Increased awareness and appreciation with relatively unconventional art forms,
- Subsequent sharing of experiences with peers and family members.

It was evident that pupils responded very thoughtfully to the practical activities undertaken both in class and at BALTIC. For example, the pupils were observed to make numerous comments about how they were feeling in relation to the comfortable or uncomfortable spaces they were making (i.e. calm in comfortable spaces, anxious in uncomfortable ones; they also commented that their cooperation had been smooth and ordered when working on comfortable spaces as opposed to uncomfortable. They were also prompted to reflect generally on the nature of space in relation to affect:

A - I like it outside better 'cause you're free and well... just to do what you want to do.

B - In dark and small [spaces], you feel really claustrophobic

C - I preferred the uncomfortable space

In this context, the pupils' teacher commented that some of the themes and their interrelations had been slightly too sophisticated for the pupils to grasp in their full complexity, but noted that, nevertheless, the session had contributed to their stock of capital in ways which might be turned to good account in future:

They understood the space issue on their own level – maybe not quite getting the more sophisticated levels of meaning, but the understanding may develop over time and become useful later on. In some respects the artist pitched too high, but the pupils nevertheless got a lot from it on their own terms.

Similarly, the education officer who had brokered the project noted that pupils 'definitely' understood the ramifications of the project work in relation to the affective values and nature of physical space, but that this understanding may have been 'subliminal'. The latter part of the class-based activity involved the making of models of comfortable environments using card, coloured paper and other basic materials. The pupils' models were largely based on their notions of ideal domestic space, commonly including large beds, sofas, televisions and computer gaming facilities. In some ways, the pupils had understood the abstract notion of 'comfortable' space in a very literal manner, i.e. in terms of the kind of surroundings which they would like to inhabit. This can be seen as the employment of a specific stock of cultural

capital (one which also relates to popular culture, such as the current swathe of TV programmes on celebrities' homes) to decode the meanings of the activity.

In a similar vein, when researchers broached the subject of comfortable space with the pupils during the second focus group, one pupil began enthusiastically to discuss the merits of his new bed. Decisions about what makes an ideal domestic environment within individual groups of pupils were also based on reaching a consensus; this appeared to be a bonding process involving the comparison and reaffirmation of individuals' likes, dislikes and values.

The visit to the British Art Show 6 was seen very positively by the pupils, who enthusiastically discussed a number of the works on show (e.g. by Tonico Lemos Auad, Phil Collins and Hew Locke). The challenge to the pupils' notions of art is exemplified in the following statement concerning Siobhán Hapaska's *Playa de los Intranquilos*:

- They [i.e. the art works on display] are interesting because like... like you understood them, you would think of making a picture or something, you wouldn't think of like making rocks on a sandy beach, watching the telly, make-cracking coconuts or something. You'd think of drawing a picture or making a sculpture or something.

While their teacher noted:

- It [i.e. the British Art Show 6] helped them to develop some openness about what art and artistic activity is.

The education officer who had brokered the project also discussed its positive impact on the pupils, in particular in relation to subsequent visits made (after the data collection period) by the same class:

I think just the presence of the building and the space itself... it's something very physical, it's very big, it's very different to school, it's very unusual, it's quite challenging, they're seeing things they're perhaps not familiar with, it's exciting, you know, the building's exciting as well as the work's exciting. ...There's photos of when they came the other week looking at And You Shall Know Our Velocity, and they're all looking at the pieces of fruit that are rotting and sending off bad smells and you can just see they're really made up with it, they're really excited, it's unusual, it's funny, it's sensory, yeah. There's one photo and it's like a Martin Parr photo, it's quite comical 'cause they're all very animated, so they're really completely engaged I think. And they haven't got the normal distractions of school or the... yeah, it's a bit of a wow factor.

In relation to further activities the education officer noted:

What happened is the students came back to Baltic and had further visits, they were very, very confident, and ... I've got pictures that I can give to you, and it's really evident just from the photographs of the engagement, or the level of engagement of the young people involved, and they were able to work with Nisha. So I think with that project those students had input from different artists, they had three different artists working with them, they also had Karen working with them, I think it's given them insights into different ways of working, it's given them skills-based activities, which I think has been really good, as well as thinking skills.

Lastly, it was clear that pupils had used their experience of the exhibition visit and the activities within subsequent social interactions:

- I went to my mates and said like it's wicked art isn't it, like? And how... how it was good, how it [inaudible] to the Baltic and stuff.

- I talked to like me sisters and stuff about it.

While these can be viewed as bonding social capital, the pupils also engaged extensively with the artist, asking questions about the artworks on display:

- [I was asking] like how did they make this? Why have they got that there? And like what's this all about? And stuff.

7.5 'Big M media lab': Isis Arts and Berwick Community High School

The respondents involved in the evaluation of this project came from two groups: some were final year 'A' level Art and Design pupils and others were GNVQ pupils. All but one (who lived ten miles away) lived within the immediate locality of Berwick. Their attitudes to Berwick as an environment were relatively negative; when asked, they stated:

A - [It's] Boring.

B - It's a nice place if you come as a tourist, for like a weekend, but anything more it's...

C - There's nought really to talk about, it's right boring. [There's] just nothing to do.

D - Half the shops are charity shops.

E - There's not really much to do, the [Berwick Film] Festival's like the first thing that's been here ever, to do stuff.

Their attitudes to school and to education were varied; the GNVQ pupils were relatively negative and the 'A' level pupils, who were all in the process of making plans for their higher education, were more positive. The following exchange is illustrative of some of the pupils' political attitudes to politics and voting:

A - [I] don't like all those black people coming in.

B - Aye, I agree with that.

A - Not in a bad way but all the... there's so many people coming in the country and I just don't...

C - You mean immigrants?

A - Immigrants.

B- Illegal immigrants.

A - *Illegal... illegal. Immigrants. I think they should maybe stop it for a year. I think they should bring the death penalty back an' all,*
(laughs)

B - *Because there's quite a lot of crime and stuff going on.*

Notably, six out of eight pupils stated that they would not vote in a general election:

[Interviewer] - *Why won't you vote, because quite a lot of you said you wouldn't do?*

- *It doesn't matter anyway, they knacker it up anyway.*

Notwithstanding the negativity and disaffection evident in some of their comments, the pupils engaged in complex leisure activities, including playing and watching rugby and football, photography lessons, and playing in a band:

- *I play guitar in a little band kind of thing, just trying to write stuff at the moment, getting more into the kind of jazzy side, than the normal rock kind of thing everyone usually does. That's fun, I like doing that.*

Most of the pupils had visited galleries in Newcastle (e.g. BALTIC), and Edinburgh (e.g. the Scottish National Gallery of Modern Art); some expressed interest in the works of Salvador Dalí and Edvard Munch and in graffiti art. One pupil in particular practised photography in his own time, and numerous pupils made a point of their preference for analogue methods:

A - *Well yeah, I just take pictures of just ra - I mean not random things, but... I mean always carry a camera with me just in case, but I do take pictures outside of school as well.*

[Interviewer] - *So do you prefer digital photography or...?*

B - *I like film photography, not digital... 'cause I think digital's more expensive, because you've got to... I don't think it's the same, 'cause once it's taken on film that's it, but when it's digital you can go back and fix what you don't like.*

C - *Digital's... just seems too easy really.*

B - *You can always make your photo perfect and there's less skill involved in digitals.*

A - *And on most digital cameras you see the picture as soon as you've taken it, but with film you have to work for..... you have to work all the stuff, and it takes you ages, and I like that.*

Pupils also demonstrated a high level of engagement with, and enthusiasm for, material covered over the course of their schooling. The following exchange, in which pupils discuss a project on the photographers Lewis Hine and Andreas Gursky, contrasts strongly with their apparent disengagement from curricula:

A - *Lewis Hine did the American Depression, and just America in the 30s. He was the only photographer on the Empire State Building when they were building it. [inaudible] And Gursky just ...*

B - *He really does everything, just contemporary stuff. He does all sorts of...*

A - *Lots of colour.*

B - *Yeah, colour, all sorts of things.*

[Interviewer] - *You said earlier that he was 'a bit freaky'.*

A - *Yeah he's... he can just take a picture of an... it's the camera he uses, it's really...*

B - *Like repetition things, a lot of his work...*

A - *It's the stock exchange, and all the different coloured shirts, he would take a picture from above, you can see everyone, pictures of all the people, and the different colours.*

A: *You could have two of his photos and they were like totally... you wouldn't think they were from the same artist.*

7.6 Shifts in capital in relation to 'Big M media lab'

The project involved visiting the Big M Gallery at the Berwick Film Festival with artist Kelly Richardson (one of whose works was on show there), after which the pupils continued to work with the artist by discussing further video pieces and developing their own individual works. These were edited for the pupils by the artist for subsequent display in the Big M in other areas. The education officer who brokered the project noted that its aim was to encourage pupils to develop awareness and capabilities which, while contextualised in artistic practice and activities, might have a broader positive bearing on their general self-confidence and self-belief, in turn potentialising access to a greater range of life choices (within and outside the sphere of art *per se*). A further aim of the project was to 'humanise' art, artistic practice and artists by involving an artist to expose the pupils to her work and the work of others, to lead the pupils' work and to help them realise their own pieces. As stated by the ISIS educator:

To give them a first hand experience of the art form, and to give them access to the artist, who was involved in that. I mean that's... that was not only there, but to bring them down to the Baltic was key to that, you know, because that's... that puts what they are... are doing into the context of the larger world.

The intentions of the ISIS education officer were highly congruent with the notion of capital as an enabling means, i.e. as a set of abilities allowing individuals to access opportunities. In this context he discussed the importance of including the artist Kelly Richardson within the delivery of the project:

I think it brings it down to a real level, a human being is there, and somebody's made this, and somebody does this as a job, and this is what somebody believes in and is passionate about, and I think that's such a crucial thing for young people to experience, that all these... otherwise everything else is just out... out there, it's all done magically by somebody else somewhere far off that's not connected to them and they will never be in that realm to experience that. Whereas if they meet somebody in their place, somebody comes to them who does do that it suddenly opens up... not just the possibility of them becoming a film artist, but the possibility of them becoming

whatever they want to become, and rather than... I've got this amount but actually the world is over there somewhere.

He went on to discuss the importance of introducing the pupils to gallery space:

I think in terms of the gallery spaces and the gallery education which is the point of the enquire project, I think it's about the again stepping over that line between your world and the rest of the world. And especially things like a gallery is a cultural you know, barrier, that you know, most people don't go to galleries, or if they do, they go on a Sunday afternoon to the Baltic and walk round saying, 'Tax payers are paying for this' and you know, 'what's all this about?' and switch off to it. Or else they think... see... either they don't understand it and go 'Well [inaudible] waste of time, waste of money' or they go 'Anyone can do that, you know, what's the point?' like that. So I think taking young people to the gallery with artists that make the stuff and they see it in the place, opens that line of, 'somebody I know has done this,' and it opens up the world that they can do whatever they want to do, but also makes them engage with the culture, and see that they... you know, even if they don't become artists, they've had an insight into how it operates, why they do it, what it is, how... what it's about, what it's trying to say, how it works, whether it's good or bad but actually how it operates and why it's there. And that's important to do because it's... otherwise they are cut off from the culture.

It is notable that in this statement the overall impact of a gallery visit or activity need not, for this education officer, be translated into a desire on the part of individuals to engage professionally with art; rather, the aim is to develop individuals' insights and awareness in a manner which will allow them to make considered personal and career decisions. According to this vision, access to certain forms of cultural capital leads to the exponential expansion of the range of choices individuals are able to make in life.

The most identifiable shifts in capital related to:

- a greater ability to engage with the techniques and practices of video art, leading to an increased awareness of artistic and professional opportunities and choices,
- an increased capacity for enthusiasm in relation to making art.

The following quotations give a sense of the sort of work which the pupils produced through the project:

- Mine's about football , and just like the... I support Rangers so I done a Rangers and Celtic game, and like all the like passion about it and stuff like that, just two different clips from it and stuff like that, and used some of the like lyrics what are quite offensive and stuff...

- Mine was I painted somebody's face just like with a paintbrush, and then it was the speed of it was like... bits of it were taken out so it was like [inaudible] when it played like [inaudible].

- Mine... the one I actually used for the project it was ... it wasn't... it was just supposed to be a joke, this man who walks around Berwick with an umbrella... umbrella, and he's a little weird, so I went and asked him if I could interview him. And at first I thought it was funny, but then we watched it over and over and just got really serious, (laughs) so I used that, for my piece.

The general development of capital within the pupil group is clearly conveyed in the teacher's description of the impact of the project:

- It got them excited, which is quite an achievement with some of them, and interested and sort of getting a feeling that they could be creative. Some of them already were... there were two kinds of student, there were the disaffected, not really interested students, and I think it had a positive impact on them, more so perhaps than with the others, because most of them...who were kind of 'didn't-want-to-be-here' and were disaffected became rather less disaffected and quite interested and excited. I can think of one student in particular who has gone through the whole of the school with an attitude of 'it-isn't-cool-to-be-interested-in-art or anything', who got very taken with it and spent quite a lot of time producing the piece that he wanted to produce. And is still... he's trying to kind of maintain this façade of being completely uninterested, but is continually asking me when the DVD's ready, and he wants... you know he's sort of quite excited by the fact that he's produced something. The more able students thoroughly enjoyed the project and found it stimulating, but they were already completely interested in video art and filmmaking, and wanted to do that kind of thing at university anyway, so the effect was less noticeable on them, than it was on the others.

Although the project involved the production of individual and not collaborative artworks, it had also allowed for shifts in social capital:

Nigel who wants to do film at university and is completely interested ... wants to be a camera man, cinematographer whatever, he was very keen to... he'd probably take over everybody else's project, but I don't want to put that next to him because he's very cooperative and enabling and helpful, he's really... he's very good for that, so he was... he was involved with, if not most, at least half of the projects one way or another that he... he was sort of wanting to be involved... and they were happy for him to come along with their ideas. Because also the... part of the creative process was to talk to... the students, talk amongst themselves about what they were doing, so it naturally turned out that there were kind of groups forming, and they worked as actors or I mean figures in each other's projects too.

However, the ISIS education officer made the following observations about one participant (who had produced a piece about Celtic and Rangers fans):

... one, once he knew that he could make a film about something that was really important to him, and he was going to have control over it, he was off, and he was you know, and it's... for Kelly [Richardson (the artist)] that's one of the best films, and he was... and he wouldn't have done... done that if he hadn't have had... if he was in a group, he wouldn't have done that, but because when he came down to it one to one, he suddenly saw that he could do... he could say something about what he really felt, you know.

On the basis of this observation it might be argued that this individual had difficulty taking the opportunity to make work which was meaningful to him through access to the social capital of the group; however, his investment in 'linking' social capital through contact with the artist on an individual level was empowering in this sense, and through these means he was able to overcome his initial inability. This shows that the activity did not necessarily facilitate group interaction in all individuals, nor was the activity's objective most effectively achieved by all through contact with peers.

The teacher also noted specific increases in skills (human capital) and attitudes and approaches to artistic practice (cultural capital):

In the case of some of the GNVQ people it would be fair to say that their creative skills were pretty close to zero in that they'd never wanted to... have never created anything before, or done anything like that before, and they were rather slow to grasp the possibility... I mean they weren't used to thinking creatively at all, I think they just didn't think creatively. And so for the first few weeks there was a sort of sense of inhibition, and they... whenever they came up with something it was like an information video kind of thing.

[Interviewer] - *They came up with stuff like information films...?*

Yeah, because that's what they thought that doing this kind of thing was, because I don't suppose they had any idea of art and creativity and [inaudible] in a sort of... creating an interaction with a... viewer sort of seeking out meaning and all those things, I mean they wanted it all to be 'This is about this and I'm going to tell you about it', and without any sense of ambiguity or the... the sort of creative interaction between viewer and screen, which is... or viewer and image which is what art to a large extent has to be about.

The teacher focused on one individual in particular whose accumulation of capital he saw as exemplary, in that it demonstrated the consequences of his acquisition of a series of understandings: of creative practices; of the roles of personal experiences and personal expression within art production; and of distinctions between creative artwork and other genres such as documentary:

And then they began to loosen up and [I'm] thinking particularly of the guy Kieran who was totally against it, and hated... hated art, hated everything and then gradually began to sort of loosen up, and he was... his original idea... he's totally into... the only thing that matters to him, or he claims matters to him is football, so he was going to make a kind of 'This is how you become a successful footballer' little video, and gradually his didacticism was worn down, so ended up making a rather interesting impressionistic study of hatred between Rangers and Celtic fans, which is a tremendous step for him.

All of the pupils stated that they had enjoyed the project and the process of producing video art, one pupil noting:

- I'd never really done anything like that before, like thought about using videos as art, so it was interesting.

Some of the pupils were also interested in the display and reception of their pieces in the aftermath of the project:

M: *It will be nice to see what other people think of it.*

L: *If they think the same... if they think... if they think the meaning of it is what you meant it to be, sort of, or if they get something different.*

K: *I don't think anyone will be interested in mine, 'cause [they won't be] interested in what I'm interested in.*

Their accounts of family members' responses to their work reflect a sense of cultural disengagement from parents and intergenerational incomprehension; however, it is not clear that this was necessarily seen in a negative light by the respondents, who may have been able to use parental responses as a means to distinguish themselves as individuals:

A: *It was pretty stupid, they [i.e. the pupil's parents] didn't really know like why we were doing it, sort of.*

B: *My mother didn't get it.*

C: *No.*

D: *Neither did my mum. My brother got it, I think my dad understood it.*

[Interviewer] - *And will they get to see your films?*

D: *Well I try and show them but they don't pay attention for much longer than thirty seconds, so...*

Indeed, the pupils showed greater proclivity to bond with their peers over the course of the project (notwithstanding the fact that they were not a closely knit group), reflecting their choice to invest in certain types of social capital rather than others. This may be seen as part of the process of respondents developing a sense of an independent adult self.

The pupils were also able to access the artist's stock of capital, and their engagement with her can be seen in terms of bridging social capital. For example, in a discussion of the pupils' experience of working with her, one pupil noted:

- *Like you didn't have to be like embarrassed if you had an idea of what you [inaudible], you just tell her and she was [inaudible].*

The artist had also used some of her own works⁹ as teaching aids, and pupils' discussion of this showed a positive engagement with them:

A: *There was a tyre on the ground, and it popped up and bounced...*

B: *It was like... [inaudible] filmed and it was rolling [inaudible] the film was going backwards, so... but it looked like... it didn't look like it was played backwards, it looked like it was moving...*

A: *Yeah...*

B: [inaudible]

A: *... plus she reversed the sound, so that the sounds would fit the thing, instead of being like...*

⁹ The work discussed below is *The Sequel* (2004); see <http://www.kellyrichardson.net/work.htm>

B: *Like backwards, it was like it was forwards, but it was actually backward, the tyre rolling inland...*

Given the age of these pupils and their places within their school careers, semi-structured discussion relating to aspects of human capital was particularly illuminating, in terms of the pupils' future education and career plans and their understanding of options within this. Firstly, it was evident that the pupils' experience of the project had continued to resonate:

[Interviewer] - *Since you've done the filmmaking projects, have you thought about it since you finished it?*

A: *Yeah.*

B: *Yeah, quite a lot.*

C: *I thought about it for a while after but I've forgotten all about to tell you the truth until today.¹⁰*

Some of the pupils also appeared to demonstrate an increase in cultural capital in relation to gallery visiting:

- *I was in Newcastle the other day, I went in to the Laing Art Gallery, but that was... that was just popping in and having a look around, for like half an hour, it was just to kill time. But it was good, I enjoyed it.*

[Interviewer] - *What was on there?*

- *Bloody hell. [laughs] I can't remember exactly. It was something obscure, something kind of abstract, it was not really my thing but it was enjoyable, I can't remember who it was.*

A number of pupils stated that the project had influenced their ideas and decisions about further education and future career plans:

A - *I want to do something with either film or audio, but I don't know which one, and I've not really had a look around that much. Next year I'm just going to... I'm going to get a job and save up some money, while looking for some nice course to do. Or I'll do a course, I don't know.*

B - *I know that I'm going to art course somewhere. like I don't know which one yet because I haven't heard back from them all, but I don't know what I'm doing after that, I don't really have a plan for a job or anything.*

C - *[I'm going to] go to uni, yeah. I know what I'm doing.*

[Interviewer] - *And you're definitely going to do a...*

¹⁰ Although this statement may seem to run counter to the others, researchers were aware of the need to balance the credence given to students' comments with an understanding of their apparent need to be perceived by others to be disengaged from cultural and curricular activities.

C: *Film Production course, yes.*

D - *Yeah, well I applied for more of an arts course, but its like Fine Art so you can do... you can get the chance to do film as well if you want, like you can choose sort of different stuff to do and probably... think I would do more film if I got the chance again.*

One pupil in particular demonstrated the outcomes of having developed new forms of capital (most especially human and cultural) through her participation in the project:

Oh well, it's kind of messed up my choices that I want to do, like what I want to take on. Because I really enjoy making [art], you know even if it's just like little sketches and stuff, I really like doing it, but I never got the chance to do it until this year, and I was just going to try and do something with audio, like sorts of different things I'd like to do. But now there's the also the film kind of thing, so there's two things, that... it's almost like...

A further pupil, who initially demonstrated high levels of disengagement from curricular and cultural activities, but whose engagement in the project had been seen to be profound, discussed his immediate plans as follows:

- Still don't know [what I'm going to do] but I think I'm going to stay on at school and do PE next year, hopefully.

Although it was evident from observing this pupil's progress over the course of the project that he had developed significant new forms of capital, this did not result in a reassessment of his career choices or his attitudes to leisure activity. For example, the same pupil noted that he had enjoyed the practical part of the project but not the gallery-based work:

- It was good, that's all I'm saying...I liked all the making parts of it up, but I didn't really like gannin' to the... like having to walk to Berwick to go to the Big M.

He also stated that he continued to dislike art in general and would be disinclined to visit museums and galleries:

- And gannin' to Newcastle to go to that museum [i.e. BALTIC Centre for Contemporary Art], like it's good that I had a day off school, but like in my own time I wouldn't like choose to go to an art gallery, just 'cause its not like... it doesn't interest me that much.¹¹

These statements show that organised access to capital (i.e. through the project) does not necessarily result in an obvious employment of that capital on the part of individuals. It may, however, be possible that this individual might employ capital accrued through the project in ways which have not been detected by this research.

8.0 Conclusions

The activities researched have led to changes in capital formations which appear to have a profound impact on some of the participants, despite the fact that some of these experiences were relatively transient. As previously stated, this general conclusion also needs to be qualified in that the activities were situated within longer (if not continuous) learning

¹¹ Note, however, the substance of footnote 10 in relation to these comments.

processes which this research has not been able to study at length because of the constraints in terms of the timescale for data collection. Broadly speaking, it can be stated that the data analysed above shows that activities have led to:

- Changes in capital formations¹²
- Increased understanding of art as a body of practices, products, technologies and heuristic/intellectual approaches (e.g. valuing subjectivity, trial and error and calculated risk-taking)
- Increased familiarity with, and ability to use, the experiences of making art, viewing art and visiting art galleries
- Increased social interaction through engagement with art (i.e. making, critiquing, showing and displaying) with family members (bonding) peers (bonding and bridging), and others, including gallery staff and artists (linking)
- Increased understanding of role of art in social, professional, economic and personal life
- Increased understanding of possible economic or employment benefits of engaging with art
- Increased self-interrogation about career plans in relation to engagement with art and the contemporary art gallery

However, there are clearly complexities associated with all of these which pertain to different age groups. For example, the instrumental use of art within family relations differed fundamentally between primary schoolchildren and the young adults at Berwick. In this sense the subjects can be seen to be using art in different ways in relation to the specific requirements of their social and personal contexts, for example, the primary schoolchildren used art to develop bonding social capital with family and siblings, whilst the older pupils appear to have used it more to construct an individual and independent identity. Likewise, while this is not intended to be a comparative study of different age groups' responses to activities, it is clear that the primary school pupils used newly developed skills and abilities in a different way from their older counterparts, i.e. as part of a range of developing assets for sporadic or short-lived use in leisure time and in relation to social bonding, rather than as a direct exploration of potentials for further academic study and/or professional choices.

It can also be concluded that schoolchildren's/pupils' artistic practice does not necessarily potentialise the development of social capital or indeed encourage socialisation (for example, the replication of work done in activities was often undertaken by pupils on a solitary basis, while one Berwick pupil appeared to have difficulty producing meaningful work in a group setting). However, the involvement of artists in brokering group work or group critique as well as individual work, and the gallery as locus for organised exploration, do appear to potentialise these aspects.

While the research has evidenced clear shifts in capital, it is difficult and problematic to predict their long-term consequences, and how, in future, they influence health, general well-being, quality of life etc.

9.0 Limitations of the project and suggestions for further research

The key limitations of the current research project were the short timescale for data collection, the limited number of subjects and the limited depth of research into subjects'

¹² It should be noted that the timetable for data collection did not permit the collection of extensive data relating to general *shifts* in capital as they pertain to, for example, crime, housing, alienation etc.

capital formations. As a consequence of budgetary constraints it was not possible to develop an appropriate longitudinal project whereby shifts in capital could be meaningfully identified over a longer timescale. For example, there was no opportunity to work again with the subjects at later stages in their school careers, thereby to attempt to gauge the longer-term impact of gallery education activities.

In terms of depth of research, the view which researchers were able to obtain of subjects' capital formations was relatively superficial, although it may have been accurate in itself. Further research might address this shortcoming by allowing for contact with subjects and, potentially, with their relatives and social acquaintances, outside of the context of the focus group itself. This is particularly important when attempting to understand the transfer of capital between different generations. These ideas for research bring specific issues with them – for example, the need to organise sustained, recurrent access to subjects, to schools and to others, and ways of resourcing and facilitating such access would need to be identified.

In general it was felt that schools had a relatively low sense of ownership of the research, meaning that, although they gave freely of their teachers' and pupils' time, their contact with the research team was limited and the team was concerned about impinging upon school activities.

This research project focused entirely on the pupils' experiences of gallery education activities; it did not examine the experiences of teachers, gallery education staff and artist educators except insofar as they helped researchers understand the pupils' experiences. In further research this imbalance may be addressed by examining the learning processes undergone by these parties, particularly as these processes are not entirely separable from those experienced by the pupils. A further aspect of some importance is the role of the artist as educator; future research could usefully focus on the impact on children and young people of interaction with artists, the pedagogies adopted by artists and the learning processes of artists engaged in education work with children and young people.

Lastly, it is evident from observations and from the data analysed that the adoption of further theoretical frameworks might help to shed light on the impact of gallery education on young people. In particular, these include theories of intrinsic and extrinsic motivation and informal learning. For example, it would be helpful to analyse the nature of pupils' motivation during gallery education activities in comparison with class-based, curricular activities; likewise, gallery education activities may be seen to represent slippage between the categories of formal and informal learning, and the ramifications of this for pedagogy and impact would constitute useful findings.

10. References

Becker, G. S. (1993) *Human Capital: a Theoretical and Empirical Analysis, with Special Reference to Education*, Chicago

Behrman, J. R. and Stacey, N. (eds) (1997) *The Social Benefits of Education*, Michigan

Bourdieu, P. and Darbel, A. (1966), *L'amour de l'art: les musées et leur public*, Paris (translated and republished in 1997 as *The Love of Art*, Padsow)

Bourdieu, P. (1997) 'Forms of Capital' in A. H. Halsey, H. Lauder, P. Brown and A. S. Wells (eds), *Education, Culture, Economy and Society*, Oxford, New York: 46-58.

- Coleman, J. (1988) 'Social Capital in the Creation of Human Capital', *American Journal of Sociology*, 94 (supplement): 95-120.
- Cote, J. E. (1996) 'Sociological Perspectives on Identity Formation: the Culture-Identity Link and Identity Capital', *Journal of Adolescence*, 19: 417-428.
- Côté, S. (2001) 'The Contribution of Human and Social Capital', *Canadian Journal of Policy Research*, 2, (1): 29-36.
- DeSimone, R.L., Werner, J.M., and Harris, D.M. (2002), *Human Resource Development*, Cincinnati, OH
- Du Gay, P., S. Hall, L. Janes, H. Mackay, and K. Negus (1997) *Doing Cultural Studies, The Story of the Sony Walkman*, London
- Faure, E. (1972) *Learning to Be – the world of education today and tomorrow*, Paris
- Gershuny, J. (2002) 'A New Measure of Social Position: Social Mobility and Human Capital in Britain'. Working papers of the Institute for Social and Economic Research, paper 2002–2, University of Essex, Colchester.
- Healy, T., Côté, S., Helliwell, J. and Held, S. (2001) *The Well-being of Nations, the role of Human and Social Capital*, Centre for educational Research and Innovation, Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development, Paris
- Hooper-Greenhill, E (2004) 'Measuring Learning Outcomes in Museums, Archives and Libraries: the Learning Impact Research Project (LIRP)', *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, 10 (2): 151-174
- Hooper-Greenhill, E. and Moussouri, T (2001a) *Making Meaning in Art Museums 1: visitors' interpretive strategies at Wolverhampton Art Gallery*, Leicester
- Hooper-Greenhill, E. and Moussouri, T (2001b) *Making Meaning in Art Museums 2: visitors' interpretive strategies at Nottingham Castle Museum and Art Gallery*, Leicester
- Mason (2004) 'Conflict and Complement: an exploration of the discourses informing the concept of the socially inclusive museum in contemporary Britain', *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, 10 (1): 49-73
- Newman, A. and Mclean, F. (2004a) 'Presumption, Policy and Practice: The Use of Museums and Galleries as Agents of Social Inclusion in Great Britain', *International Journal of Cultural Policy*, 10 (2): 167-181.
- Newman, A. and Mclean, F. (2004b) 'Capital and the Evaluation of the Museum Experience', *International Journal of Cultural Studies*, 7 (4): 480-498.
- Newman, A., Mclean, F. and Urquhart, G. (2005) 'Museums and the Active Citizen: Tackling the Problems of Social Exclusion', *Citizenship Studies*, 9 (1): 41-57.
- Newman, A. and Mclean, F. (2006) 'The Impact of Museums on Identity', *International Journal of Heritage Studies*, 12 (1): 49-68

Newman, A. and Whitehead, C. (2006), *Fivearts Cities: an evaluative report on the impact on over 50s people of participation in activities related to British Art Show 6*, unpublished report for Baltic Centre for Contemporary Art

Peräkylä, A. (2004) 'Reliability and validity in research based on naturally occurring social interaction' in Silverman, D. (ed), *Qualitative Research: theory, method and practice*, London: 283-304

Putnam, R.D. (2000) *Bowling Alone: the collapse and revival of American community*, New York

Schultz, T. W. (1961) 'Investment in Human Capital', *The American Economic Review*, 51 (1): 1-17

Sfard, A. (1998) 'On Two Metaphors for Learning and the Dangers of Choosing Just One', *Educational Researcher*, 27 (2): 4-13

Stanley, J., Galloway, S., Huddleston, P., Grewcock, C., Muir, F., Newman, A., Clive, S. (2004) *The Impact of Phase 2 of the Museums and Galleries Education Programme*, Warwick

Veenstra, G. (2001) 'Social Capital and Health' *Canadian Journal of Policy Research*, 2 (1): 72-8

Whitehead, C. (2005), 'Visiting with Suspicion: recent perspectives on art museums and galleries', in Corsane, G. (ed.) *Heritage, Museums and Galleries: an introductory reader*, London and New York: 89-101

Willms, J.D. (2001) 'Three Hypotheses about Community Effects on Social Outcomes', *Canadian Journal of Policy Research*, 2 (1): 53-62

As with SE report – should descriptions of the projects and staff / teacher names be included?

Appendix: Summary of baseline data

Name and address of organisation	Project evaluated	Organisation Type	Participating School	Type of project	Links with National Curriculum
<p>ISIS Arts 5 Charlotte Square Newcastle upon Tyne NE1 4XF</p> <p>Tel: 0191 261 4407</p> <p>e-mail john@isisarts.org.uk http://www.isisarts.org.uk/</p>	Big M media labs	Independent	<p>Berwick Community High School Adams Drive Berwick Upon Tweed Northumberland TD15 2JF</p> <p>Martin Patterson</p>	Pupils produced 'New Media' work with the teacher and video artist	Group work a combination of GNVQ and A level
<p>Laing Art Gallery New Bridge Street Newcastle upon Tyne NE1 8AG</p> <p>Tel: 0191 232 7734</p> <p>http://www.twmuseums.org.uk/laing/</p>	Artists in Society	Local authority gallery	<p>Thomas Walling Primary Lindfield Avenue Blakelaw Newcastle upon Tyne NE5 3PL</p>	Pupils, through studio visits, question and answer sessions and practical work investigated the role of the artist in society	<p>Art at KS1 links with KS2 Art units 1b, 3a, 4,a,b &c and 5d</p> <p>QCA art Unit 3c</p> <p>English En1</p>
<p>BALTIC Centre for Contemporary Art South Shore Road Gateshead Tyne and Wear NE8</p> <p>Tel: 0191 4404929</p> <p>http://www.balticmill.com/</p>		Gallery	<p>High Spenn Primary School Hugar Road High Spenn Tyne and Wear NE39 2BQ</p> <p>Ruth Whiteside</p> <p>Hookergate School High Spenn Rowlands Gill NE39 2BX</p> <p>Colin Turnbull</p>	A class from High Spenn School visited BALTIC and took part in a workshop with Cath Campbell (BALTIC Freelance Artist). Cath Campbell then delivered a session at the school. This group	

				visited BALTIC again with Hookergate School in the autumn term.	
--	--	--	--	---	--